

Running head: A PROPOSAL CRITIQUE

A Proposal Critique

By:

Kanasha L. N. Blue

Niagara University

Fall 2018

ADS: 807

Proposal Overview

The research proposal entitled “Implications of educational attainment for Sudanese youth who entered foster care” was written by Unique Outlaw (2018), in partial fulfillment of requirements for course ADS:807, Geographic Information System. The research method for this proposal is a Geographic Information Systems. The proposal contains eleven subsections including an Abstract, Introduction, Review of Literature, Theoretical Framework, GIS Project Model, Research Questions and Sub-Questions, Outcomes, Model Design, Limitations, Conclusion and Reference. The proposal plans on examining eight research questions and sub-questions regarding the educational resilience of young Sudanese refugees who are apart of the American foster care system. The proposal pays close attention to the academic success of this population despite hardship and barriers to education.

Introduction

John Creswell (2014), notes that an introduction is an integral part of a dissertation, scholarly research study proposal or journal article. A strong opening is essential because this is the first chance for the author to grab the attention of the reader. An excellent introductory paragraph has the following components: stating the research question, background material of studies about the problem, identifying deficiencies in these studies, the significance of the study amongst particular audiences and reporting the purpose statement. Other vital elements of an introduction are noting its importance to the field, identifying and defining key terms and concepts and ensuring it well written (Creswell 2014, Huang 2017).

Outlaw (2018), research proposal met most of the requirements outlined by John Creswell for an excellent introduction. A detailed background on the topics of Sudanese refugees was given, along with the reason the author chose the topic and the research implicants for the

A Proposal Critique

social science field. The writer used many primary sources to relay the importance of the topic. This section could have been enhanced with some statistical figures to shore up the extent of the educational attainment for foster care youth of Sudanese descent. The introduction did not clearly identify the target audience of this research; however, the overall introduction was understandable to a professional audience but not so intelligible that only specialists in fields of social work and foster care could understand the information.

Literature Review

The characteristics of an outstanding literary review section of any study include clarifying and defining the problem within a broader context, place the area of research, summarizes the investigation of previous studies and provided a comprehensive and accurate representation of the current state of the investigation. It is also essential to identify themes and relationships along with contradictions, inconsistencies, and gaps in recent studies. An outstanding literary review section will establish a theoretical framework for exploring holes and inconsistencies and suggest the next steps in solving the problem (American Psychological Association, 2010, Creswell, 2014).

Outlaw (2018), identified numerous relevant examples of other studies and a discussion of their finds, including finding that agree, disagree and contradict the outcome of Outlaw's hypothesis. A comparison of this nature, showing the differences between this research and previous research add credibility and reliability. The literature review of this proposal fails to develop the research question further, and identify gaps in the research that this study can fill. Outlaw (2018), did identify many common themes amongst primary source that assisted in strengthening the argument of this proposal.

Theoretical Framework

The next section in the proposal was a theoretical framework. A theoretical or conceptual framework is supposed to give depth to the study by providing a visual or narrative of the

A Proposal Critique

connections amongst critical elements in the behavioral and social science. Outlaw (2018), stated the theoretical framework of this proposal was intended to show the implications of educational success as viewed from a social work context by identifying the risks and protective factors as well as theoretical positions.

Although the abstract outlined the intent for a robust theoretical framework, the proposal failed to deliver in this section. Outlaws (2018), theoretical concept section was more of a continuation of the literature review and lack solid connections between social science concepts or social work concept and the topic at hand. This section could have benefited from introducing such traditional behavioral science theory such as grounded theory. The author did touch on resilience as a significant theoretical concept of this proposal, which gave a further argument to the proposed research.

GIS Project Model

The research model or design is a substantial section of any proposal as it offers an adequate description of the procedure used in the study, allowing the reader to understand the study complexity fully (American Psychological Association [APA], 2010). A detailed research design is pertinent to the replication of the study. The author of the proposal identified that map plotting through geographic information system would be used to attempt to use visual representation to show foster care trends in the United States and Africa. The author clearly identified the source of the output data as the U.S Census, Bureau of Statistics Child Welfare Gateway. The output data as stated by Outlaw (2018), would be in the form of excel used to create shapefiles through the GIS software. The outcome of the data will produce maps that plot visual representation in the areas of Michigan, Mexico; Buffalo, NY; and Missouri.

A Proposal Critique

The GIS Project model section also called for the author to discuss the strength and weakness of the research design. Outlaw (2018), failed to identify the strength of this research method compared to other designs. For the limitation section, limitations of the refugees were clearly defined but fail to show the limitations of the study proposal. An inference can be drawn that a limitation of this research design in the reliability of the data.

Quality of Written Communication

The final section of this critique is to discuss the quality of the writing associated with this proposal. Guidelines for a well-round research documents includes ensuring the document complies with the APA format outlined by the American Psychological Association Manual and has no spelling errors. Spelling errors or the miss use of a word makes the document unreadable and confuses the audience. Essential components of APA formatting that should be clear in the research proposal included accurate and consistent citation of sources and references and following appropriate APA outline for document formatting. There were 58 combined grammar errors, punctuation mistakes, contextual spelling errors, and sentence structure issues within this proposal which reduce the clarity of the document. Some of those errors included improper punctuation such as not placing periods at the end of a sentence, or missing comma's in in-text citations. The proposal according to the Grammarly program also contain 11% improper citation or instance of unoriginal text where the author failed to include page numbers for direct quotes or use quotation on information that was not original to the author. The reference page also contained a number of formatting issues.

References

- American Psychological Association. (2010). *Publication manual of the American Psychological Association*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Huang, J. (2017). ADS 805 Rubric for Quantitative Dissertation Critique [Class Hand out]. Research and Statistics, Niagara University, Lewiston, New York.
- Outlaw, U. (2018). Implications of educational attainment for Sudanese youth who entered foster care. Unpublished manuscript, Niagara University, Lewiston, New York